

THE SCHOOL DISTRICT OF PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA

OFFICE OF INSPECTOR GENERAL 3318 FOREST HILL BLVD., C-306 WEST PALM BEACH, FL 33406

(561) 434-7335 FAX: (561) 434-8652 www.palmbeachschools.org

LUNG CHIU, CIG, CPA INSPECTOR GENERAL SCHOOL BOARD
CHUCK SHAW, CHAIR
FRANK A. BARBIERI, JR, ESQ., VICE CHAIR
MARCIA ANDREWS
KAREN M. BRILL
DEBRA L. ROBINSON, M.D.
ERICA WHITFIELD

ROBERT M. AVOSSA, Ed. D., SUPERINTENDENT

#### MEMORANDUM

TO:

Honorable Chair and Members of the School Board

Dr. Robert Avossa, Superintendent

Chair and Members of the Audit Committee

KLC

FROM:

Lung Chiu, Inspector General

DATE:

June 21, 2016

SUBJECT:

Transmittal of Final Report

Case # 16-409 Leasing of Roosevelt Full Service Center to Inner City Youth

In accordance with School Board Policy 1.092(6)(d), we hereby transmit the above-referenced final report.

The Superintendent requested a review of the Roosevelt Full Service Center summer camp. Specifically, to determine whether the District received payments related to the leasing of facilities for the camp.

During our review, it was determined there was an unpaid balance of \$7,492 in rental fees for the use of the school facility for the camp. Subsequent to the OIG's inquiries regarding the unpaid rental fees, payment was remitted to the school, leaving no unpaid balance.

# Office of Inspector General The School District of Palm Beach County

Case No. 16-409

Leasing of Roosevelt Full Service Center to Inner City Youth

#### FINAL REPORT

The Office of Inspector General (OIG) received a referral from the Superintendent requesting a review to determine whether the leasing of the Roosevelt Full Service Center for summer camp complies with District procedures.

#### **BACKGROUND**

Inner City Youth "Getting There", Inc. ("Inner City") is a nonprofit corporation registered in the State of Florida in 1989. Beginning in 1989, Inner City has conducted summer camp at District facilities. Please see Exhibit A for information regarding the initial inception of the camp.

A review of Annual Reports from 1995 until 2015 filed with the Florida Department of State Division of Corporations, reflected Inner City's principal place of business as the District facility, known as the Roosevelt Full Service Center ("Roosevelt"). The 2016 filing reflects the Palm Beach Kennel Club as Inner City's principal place of business. The Secretary/ Treasurer of Inner City, Kathy Klotz, is an employee of the Palm Beach Kennel Club, and has been noted as the Secretary/Treasurer with all annual filings of the organization.

During the summer of 2011, the District renamed Roosevelt to the Riviera Beach Preparatory and Achievement Academy ("Achievement Academy") and relocated the school from Tamarind Avenue to Garden Road in West Palm Beach. The responsibility for leasing Roosevelt's facility has remained with the Achievement Academy's administration.

#### **LEASE AGREEMENTS**

School Board Policy 7.18 ("Policy") governs Community Use of School Facilities. The Policy provides that:

- Only the school Principal may execute a lease agreement
- The lease must be ... signed by all parties at lease forty-eight (48) hours prior to the use of the facility
- The school must retain ... a fully executed lease agreement with all additional required documentation in its files

- No leases shall extend beyond the end of the fiscal year unless approved by the Superintendent, or designee for good cause shown
- Fees are to be paid by check or credit card...at least forty-eight (48) hours prior to the use of a facility

The OIG reviewed the related leasing agreements and corresponding lease payments available in Tririga, the District's leasing software system ("leasing system") for the period June 2012 through July 2015.<sup>1</sup> In 2012, Inner City had a combined lease for June and July. Beginning with calendar year 2013, there were two separate leases per summer session (one each for June and July) due to the camp sessions occurring in two fiscal years.

We met with Achievement Academy's Principal, Elaine Hubbard-Williams, and Data Processor, Shelinita Mucklin, who currently serves as the leasing coordinator.

Ms. Hubbard-Williams stated that the leasing responsibilities were transitioned from her to Mucklin in the beginning of the 2013-14 school year, at the request of the then Principal Dr. Glenda Garrett. Hubbard-Williams stated that Dr. Garrett did not feel facility leasing should be the responsibility of an Assistant Principal. Hubbard-Williams stated she would sign on to Tririga and allow Ms. Mucklin to perform the leasing coordinator responsibilities. According to District records, Ms. Mucklin received her own access to the leasing system on October 31, 2014.

#### NO LEASE AGREEMENT OR PAYMENT FOR JUNE 2014 OR JULY 2015

Inner City utilized the District's facility in June 2014; however, there was no executed lease agreement and the District received no payment from Inner City for the use of the facility.

According to Hubbard-Williams, the nonexistence of the lease agreements for June and July 2014 were discovered during a review conducted by the then Principal, Dr. Garrett and others in September 2014.

Mucklin created a lease agreement retroactively for July 2014 summer camp in September 2014; however, no lease was generated for June 2014. According to Ms. Mucklin, the 2014 leases were overlooked due to her new role as a leasing coordinator. Ms. Hubbard-Williams stated she was unaware as to why leases for both June and July were not prepared.

In July 2015, Inner City used the District's facility; however, there was no executed lease agreement, and the District received no payment for the use of the facility.

2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> No earlier records regarding Inner City are contained in the leasing system.

The leasing system indicates Hubbard-Williams created the leases for June and July 2015 in the system on June 11, 2015. However, the July 2015 lease was never executed because the applicable waiver<sup>2</sup> was not entered into the leasing system, resulting in the lease being generated with an erroneous amount due. Inner City's Executive Director returned the lease, asking if it was possible to have the lease resubmitted with the waiver. According to Hubbard-Williams, Ms. Mucklin did inform her that the lease was returned, unsigned.

The July 2015 lease was never regenerated in the leasing system and as a result, there was no lease agreement for that month. According to Ms. Mucklin, she had a very heavy workload and was not comfortable enough with the leasing system to know how to reissue the lease, resulting in the matter being overlooked.

#### LATE PAYMENTS

Based on our review of District records in the school's internal accounts and leasing system, the Roosevelt facility was utilized by Inner City without an approved or fully executed agreement for the months of June and July for 2012 through 2015; and Inner City payments were remitted late. See schedule below:

Lease Agreement				Payments	
Lease Period	Executed	Date Executed	Late?	Payment Date	Days Late
June 2012	Yes	06/07/12	No	10/03/12	109
July 2012	Yes	06/07/12	No	10/03/12	109
June 2013	Yes	10/03/13	Yes	02/27/14	257
July 2013	Yes	10/03/13	Yes	02/27/14	248
June 2014	No	Not Applicable		04/05/16	662*
July 2014	Yes	09/09/14	Yes	05/14/15	319
June 2015	Yes	Undated	Unknown	07/07/15	24
July 2015	No	Not Applicable		04/05/16	274*

\*Subsequent to the OIG's inquiries regarding nonpayment for the June 2014 and July 2015 leases, Inner-City remitted payment in the amounts of \$2,473.65 and \$5,018 respectively.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The School's portion (65%) of the facility fees may be waived if certain criteria are met. The lessee must be a non-profit organization; and the facility shall be used for the benefit of the District's student population. The District's portion (35%) may not be waived.

In summary, all payments were late, ranging between 24 and 662 days, and the facility was utilized without a signed and dated executed lease agreement for both June and July of 2013, 2014, and 2015.

## ACHIEVEMENT ACADEMY PRINCIPAL HAS LONG STANDING WORK RELATIONSHIP WITH INNER CITY

Inner City corporate filings list Ms. Hubbard-Williams as a Director from 1995 through 2015. Hubbard-Williams, stated she was unaware Inner City continued to list her as a board member subsequent to "2010-11." The OIG noted that Hubbard-Williams' Director designation is no longer reflected on the 2016 filing.

Inner City corporate filings also list District employee, Joyce Smith as a Director. Ms. Smith, who is reflected on Inner City's letterhead as "Founder/Executive Director" is currently a Teacher at Bear Lakes Middle School.

Elaine Hubbard-Williams became the Assistant Principal of the Achievement Academy (formerly Roosevelt) in August 2010 and was later appointed Principal in April 2015.

District PeopleSoft records indicate Hubbard-Williams had an additional job with the District as the "coordinator leased facilities" beginning in August 2008. District records currently reflect Hubbard-Williams as a leasing coordinator, earning approximately \$15,556 in total, for the leasing coordinator position from 2010 through February 2015.

A review of Inner City's tax filing for 2013 indicates the entity compensated Hubbard-Williams as a Program Director totaling \$8,620. The Secretary/Treasurer for Inner City stated that Ms. Hubbard-Williams works as an independent contractor for Inner City and was paid bi-weekly in the weeks leading up to and during camp.

#### 2016 SUMMER CAMP

As of April 2016, a lease agreement for the 2016 summer camp had not been approved. We noted advertising during June 13 through July 29, 2016 for the camp location; and, the camp is listed on the District's 2016 summer camp directory posted on the District's website. It is anticipated the 2016 camp will serve approximately 200 District students.

Inner City's Secretary/Treasurer, Kathy Klotz, stated to the OIG that Inner City is in a position to pay in advance all leasing fees associated with the 2016 summer camp.

In May 2016, a lease agreement with Inner City was approved for the summer camp to be facilitated at West Riviera Elementary.

#### AFFECTED PARTY RESPONSE

The OIG provided a draft copy of this report to Ms. Hubbard-Williams and Ms. Mucklin, who were given an opportunity to respond. A response from Ms. Hubbard-Williams was received, and is attached as Exhibit B. It should be noted the final version of this report has been modified so that what is referred to as "On page 3, Paragraph 3" on the response is now Page 3, Paragraph 1.

No responsive comments were received by Ms. Mucklin.

--END---

0

G+1

15

Recommend (0

Inner-city Children Acquire Self-esteem, Sense Of Community - tribunedigital-sunsentinel Page 1 of 3

2016 Subaru Crosstrek Hybrid Touring \$30,921 STOCK #. R016852

Schumacher Subaru

Vésg Pahn Beach, FL

Home → Collections → Parents

## Inner-city Children Acquire Self-esteem, Sense Of Community

July 27, 1989 | By MICHELLE MARTIN, Special to the Sun-Sentinel

It's a novel idea, letting inner-city community leaders work with inner-city children to convince them that to succeed Ø, they have to try.

But that's what Pat Rooney, president of the Palm Beach County Kennel Club, and Pat Pepper Schwab &, then-mayor of West Palm Beach, came up with when they met with people active in West Palm Beach's northwest side neighborhoods.

And that's what Joyce Smith, a teacher at Roosevelt Elementary School, is trying to do with the Inner City Youth Gelting There <u>Program</u> of. "The people they see with the nice cars and the flashy clothes around here are the dealers," said Smith, who was on Rooney's and Schwab's committee. "They need to see people who drive BMWs and Mercedes who work hard for what they have."

And they need to work hard to pull themselves up, and then turn around to help someone else in the community. That's what Getting There is all about. "This is not a recreational program," Smith said. "This is a learning program & We keep them going all the time, and everything they do is learning."

The 64 children, ages 6 to 12, learn reading and get math <u>tutoring</u>  $extbf{2}$ . They learn tennis, and they recently had their first swimming lesson. And they have a drug awareness program, computer classes and drawing and singing. Through it all, they learn respect, for themselves and others.

"I'm learning to be responsible, and to respect other people and myself," said Don Curtis Ward, 11. "That's how they treat you here."

"I like them all. They're not bad," said counselor Susie Hudson, 17. "They're kids. And they're learning respect, and to have friendships." Hudson was in Smith's class in <u>elementary school</u> &, she said.

The lessons of Getting There are simple. It's not OK to hit. You can talk without being put down. You can't do it unless you try.

#### Find More Stories About

Start At Young Age To Say 'No'

**Related Articles** 

December 14, 2004

Teach Children Respect

Being Bored No Excuse For Being Bad At School

Retiring Teacher Earns A's From Parents

Taser No Solution To Child 'Acting Up'

Parents

Respect



#### Texas Roadhouse Coupons

befrugal.com/TexasRoadhouse Free Coupons for Texas Roadhouse. Print Your Free

Coupons Now!

### Work At Home (2016)

careercolleges.com \$29-\$39/hr Real Work At Home Job. No Boss, No Scam, Work From Home.

#### Work at Home Jobs (2016)

weeklymarks.com \$47/hr Part-Time Job Openings. Requirements: Must Have Computer.

``We took our little kids swimming yesterday, and you heard a lot of `No, I can`t do it`s,``` Smith said.
``But then one of the littlest kids -- she just turned 6 -- said, 'Yes you can. You can try.```

Almost more difficult than teaching the children is teaching the parents new attitudes. "They come to pick the kids up at the end of the day, and they say 'What'd he do today?" Smith said, "They expect it to be something bad, They expect them to fail."

And too often, when the parents think the children are failing in some ways, they punish them with a belt or a stick.

"That's what teaches the children a lot of this, the fists," Smith said, making punching motions. "They don't get much of this, the love," she said, crossing her hands over her chest.

One day, Smith said, they even took the time to teach some of the little ones how to hug.

All of the classes and lessons are taught by professionals in their fields, usually blacks who grew up and came back to the inner city to share what they've learned.

Wayne Leonard, who teaches music, said he always tries to teach songs with some kind of a message. The first song the children learned was You've Got a Friend. When they sing, they stand straight, with both feet on the floor and hands at their sides, or they sit straight up with their hands on their knees.

http://articles.sun-sentinel.com/1989-07-27/news/8902220913\_1\_teaching-children-respect 3/11/2016

Inner-city Children Acquire Self-esteem, Sense Of Community - tribunedigital-sunsentinel Page 2 of 3

When Leonard asks for a soloist to sing the parts the children learned the week before, Shaleena Bell sneaks her hand up. She stands as straight as possible in her red knee socks and blue shoes and bells out the first verse as loudly as her 6-year-old voice can.

When she's done, everybody applauds and she hides her face, smiling but embarrassed.

"When she came here, she was always walking around with her head down," Smith said. "Now look at her." Shaleena doesn't appear to notice the change. She says she likes the program "because it's fun." And she likes to sing, she said.

The seven-week summer program costs \$10 per child, mostly to convince parents that it is not just a drop-off center. When parents register their children, they also have to promise to get involved with at least two of the activities the program offers, and to come to the play the children will present at the end of the summer.

All of the start-up <u>funding</u> & came from Rooney and various donations. "I really have to hand it to Pat Rooney," Smith said. "He put his money where his mouth was."

The <u>school district</u> ☑ is donating the space in Roosevelt Junior High, and local professionals, from Leonard to Mayor James Poole, are giving up their time.

"I haven't gone to one person and asked for assistance and had them say no," Smith said.

A lot of the supervision comes from the teen-age counselors, who were recruited from local youth <a href="mailto:organizations">organizations</a> \textstyle A. They don't get paid, but they get to learn everything the children do, plus some additional training, like how to answer the telephone.

An index card sits next to the phone to ensure polite help. "Otherwise they'd answer the phone, "Yo, baby,"" Smith said, "No one ever told them how else to do it."

### Work at Home Jobs (2016)

14.5

weeklymarks.com

\$47/hr Part-Time Job Openings. Requirements: Must Have Computer.

#### See Also

- 1. Kids Nutrition Quiz
- 2. Children Hygiene
- 3. Children Health Insurance
- 4. Find Local Pediatricians
- 5. Baby Health Care Tips
- 6. Dealing with Depression
- 7. How to improve Your Self-Esteem
- 8. Self Help Motivation

om the Web

Sponsored Links by Taboola

A Jaw-Dropping Credit Card Extended Their 0% Intro APR To 18 Months  ${\tt NextAdvisor}$ 

How Could These 4 Credit Cards Help You Save Big? LendingTree

Homeowners Who Have Not Missed A Payment in 3 Years Are In For A Big Surprise Comparisons.org

The Story Behind Your Last Name Will Surprise You Ancestry

20 Awesome (Rare) Jaw Dropping Photos Of Famous Icons World Lifestyle

http://articles.sun-sentinel.com/1989-07-27/news/8902220913\_1\_teaching-children-respect 3/

3/11/2016

To: Inspector General

From: Elaine Hubbard-Williams

Date: April 29, 2016

Re: Written Response

Leasing of Roosevelt to Inner City Youth

I reviewed the information presented, please find below a few points of clarification. I appreciate the professionalism shown by your team throughout the process.

On page 3, Paragraph 3 of your report you indicate that I (Elaine Hubbard-Williams) created the lease. However, as I stated in the interview, I have not created leases since 2014. I shared that Ms. Mucklin was responsible for generating leases upon Dr. Garrett becoming principal. Please note that once Ms. Mucklin received her sign-on, *The Leasing Department* was contacted by Dr. Garrett, informing them that I should be removed and Ms. Mucklin needed access to both location, since she was responsible for completing the leases. *The Leasing Department* indicated that one person could not be assigned to two school locations in TRIRIGA, in spite of our unique situation. At that point Dr. Garret stated that Ms. Mucklin would have to use my sign-on in order to complete any leases at the Roosevelt site, and use her personal sign-on to complete leases at Riviera Beach Prep.

At that point a request was made to combine the two facilities in the TRIRIGA for both our sites, *The Leasing Department* stated that this was not possible. Dr. Garrett directed Ms. Mucklin to continue to complete all leases, and I was required to log-in for her when a lease request was made for the use of Roosevelt.

After becoming the Principal, I made the request to be removed as lease coordinator. At that point I requested another administrator be added to ensure that we could continue to complete leases for Roosevelt, in addition to the fact that I would be approving the leases. It was not until March 2016 that *The Leasing Department* came up with solution to provide Ms. Mucklin access to creating leases for both facilities with one sign-on.

On page 4 of the report, it states that I am currently listed as leasing coordinator, I am not sure why this remains. In the past I was asked by all the principal that I worked for, to cover events as the lease coordinator.

As a small school, numerous people serve as the "lease coordinator." Although "lease coordinator" is listed with their ID # they do not have the responsibility of completing leases. These are individual staff member other than custodians who are willing to work weekends and after hours. This is necessary when managing two facilities with an extremely small staff and multiple activities going on at both, various staff members are asked to work to ensure that a district staff is on site at all leasing events. As a school we were directed to list them as "lease coordinators" for compensation purposes.